

DEGAS THE SCULPTOR

Walter F. Maibaum

Exhibition Curator

PART ONE

“Bronze is for Eternity”

Edgar Degas speaking to his dealer Ambroise Vollard

When gazing upon these extraordinary sculptures, it is hard to imagine that not a single Degas bronze was ever cast during the artist's lifetime. Every bronze in every museum, and in every other public and private collection around the world, was cast after the artist's death.

Edgar Degas, who was born on July 19, 1834, began sculpting in the late 1850s.¹ While the original sculptures he made are commonly referred to as his “waxes,” they were primarily made of a soft modeling clay known as plasteline which Degas then often mixed with beeswax. These materials remained malleable and gave him the flexibility he needed to rework his original waxes over long periods of time. He took great pleasure in experimenting and continued to do so in an attempt to capture the perfect form. These were very personal intimate objects.

Degas had plasters made from his original waxes during his lifetime but none were exposed to the public. The artist only allowed one sculpture to be exhibited. It was the original wax of his most important sculpture, *La Petite Danseuse de Quatorze Ans* (*The Little Dancer, Age Fourteen*) (henceforth: the “*Little Dancer*”). The wax of the *Little Dancer* was shown in 1881 in the Sixth Impressionist Exhibition in Paris. It was radically modern and received mixed critical reviews.

In *L'Art Moderne*, Joris-Karl Huysmans, wrote: “At once refined and barbarous with her ingenious costume and her colored flesh, which palpitates, furrowed by the work of the muscles, this statuette is the only truly modern attempt I know of in sculpture.”²

Others saw it differently. In *L'Exposition des Indépendants*, Paul Mantz stated: “The piece is completed, and let's admit it right away, the result is almost frightening.” He continues: “May it please heaven that my daughter does not become a dancer.”³

Elie de Mont was even more cynical. In *La Civilisation*, she wrote: “This opera rat has something about her of the monkey, the shrimp, the runt. Any smaller and one would be tempted to enclose her in a jar of alcohol.”⁴

Discouraged by public reaction and the hostility of critics, Degas never exhibited another sculpture for the rest of his life.

Degas died on September 27, 1917. Shortly after his death, the artist's dealer and an executor of his estate, Paul Durand-Ruel (1831-1922), and his colleague, the noted dealer Ambroise Vollard (1865-1939) who was also a friend of the artist, found about one hundred fifty of the artist's original sculptures scattered around the three floors of Degas' apartment and studio at 6, Boulevard de Clichy in Montmartre,⁵ Paris' 9th arrondissement. They were mostly waxes along with a few clays (presumably terra cottas) and plasters.

Based on various accounts some had undeveloped or incomplete forms, others had broken parts beyond repair while many had collapsed or sagged on their armatures. Durand-Ruel and Vollard found that eighty of them -- seventy-four of the waxes, four clays and two plasters -- were well-formed, complete and in a good state

of preservation. They were inventoried as part of the artist's estate.⁶ The others were apparently discarded.

The artist's heirs contacted Adrien-Aurelin Hébrard (1865-1937), the owner of the Paris foundry, A.-A. Hébrard et Cie (the "Hébrard Foundry"), in hopes of casting bronzes. The heirs and Hébrard decided to have bronzes made from seventy-three of the waxes and one of the plasters. On May 13, 1918, the contract between Degas' heirs and Hébrard was signed whereby the foundry was to cast twenty-two bronzes from each of those seventy-three waxes and from the plaster.⁷

Each of the waxes and the plaster was assigned an inventory number by the foundry, and today each is cataloged and commonly referred to by its individual Hébrard number. The waxes are cataloged as Hébrard numbers 1 to 27, and numbers 29 to 74. Number 28 is the plaster (*Torso*).

The Hébrard Foundry began casting bronzes in 1919. The first set was purchased in 1921 by the American collector, Louisine (Mrs. H.O.) Havemeyer (1855-1929), who once cautioned an observer: "It takes special brain cells to understand Degas."⁸ She purchased the set at the urging of her dear friend and advisor, the American Impressionist, Mary Cassatt (1844-1926) who had written to her: "I have studied Degas' bronzes for months. I believe he will live to be greater as a sculptor than as a painter."⁹ The Havemeyer set of bronzes was bequeathed to the Metropolitan Museum of Art in New York in 1929.

Hébrard continued to cast bronzes until 1936 when sales stopped due to the world-wide depression. The business failed in 1937 and the foundry closed its doors. The foundry's owner, Adrien-A. Hébrard, died the same year. Presumably that ended the casting of the bronzes and the history of Degas' sculptures. But that was not to be.

Twelve years later, in 1949, Nelly Hébrard, the daughter of Adrien-A. Hébrard, purchased certain rights from the artist's heirs which allowed her to cast bronzes. Then in 1955 she made a surprising announcement. Along with the *Little Dancer* wax which was previously known to have survived, she revealed that sixty-nine of the other Degas original waxes had also survived along with the *Torso* plaster.

This was startling news. Everyone, including the leading Degas scholar of the time, John Rewald (1912-1994) who wrote *DEGAS, Works in Sculpture: A Complete Catalog*, published in 1944 by Pantheon Books, New York, had assumed the waxes had been destroyed.¹⁰

Nelly Hébrard sold the waxes and the *Torso* plaster through the New York gallery, M. Knoedler & Company, Inc. to the American philanthropist, Paul Mellon. He gifted the *Torso* plaster and fifty-one of the waxes, including the *Little Dancer* wax, to the National Gallery of Art in Washington, D.C. Nine others were given to the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts in Richmond, four to the Musée du Louvre in Paris (now in the Musée d'Orsay in Paris), three to the Fitzwilliam Museum in Cambridge, England, and one to the Yale University Art Gallery in New Haven, Connecticut.

Nelly Hébrard also revealed that two plaster sculptures of the *Little Dancer* had been made from Degas' wax in 1921. John Rewald acquired one of the plasters, most likely in the late 1940s, from Nelly Hébrard. He sold the plaster in 1968 to Paul Mellon, and in 1985, Mr. and Mrs. Mellon donated the plaster to the National Gallery of Art in Washington, D.C. The other *Little Dancer* plaster was purchased from Nelly Hébrard in 1956 by M. Knoedler & Company. In 1985, Knoedler donated the plaster to the Joslyn Art Museum in Omaha, Nebraska. Arthur Beale, Chairman Emeritus of the Department of Conservation and Collections Management at the Museum of Fine

Arts, Boston, rightly determined this plaster served as the master from which the Hébrard *Little Dancer* bronzes were cast.¹¹

Another milestone in the history of Degas' sculptures occurred in 1976. The Lefevre Gallery in London exhibited a previously undocumented set of bronzes. Each bronze in the set was stamped with the word *Modèle* (*modèle* is the French word for model). The set was owned by Nelly Hébrard and sold through the Lefevre Gallery to the Norton Simon Art Foundation in 1976. Today it can be seen in the Norton Simon Museum of Art in Pasadena, California.

Arthur Beale concluded the *Modèle* set was a master set of bronzes.¹² Thus it was determined that with the exception of the *Little Dancers*, all the other bronzes in museums, and in every other public and private collection around the world, had been cast from the *Modèle* set of bronzes.

A new and exciting chapter in the history of Degas' sculptures began in 2001 when my colleague, the scholar Lawrence Saphire,¹³ telephoned to ask if I was aware that a new bronze edition of the *Little Dancer* was being cast in France. It didn't seem possible. There were only two known plasters of the *Little Dancer* and both were in museums. Yet one would have been needed to cast an edition of bronzes, and clearly neither the National Gallery nor the Joslyn Art Museum would loan their plaster for that purpose.

I thought perhaps a third plaster might exist that was unknown to current scholars. If that were so a bronze edition could indeed be cast. I investigated that possibility along with Carol Conn, my partner and wife, and Mr. Saphire. It turned out to be true.

We flew to France and made many inquiries. Eventually we were led to an unknown plaster version of the *Little Dancer*. While I had little doubt it was created by Edgar Degas, some elements on the plaster did not conform to the two known posthumous plasters made by the Hébrard foundry in 1921.

But despite some significant differences I felt that only Degas himself could have created something so masterful. I also believed it could not have been a copy or a fake, for had it been, the compositional forms on this plaster would have more closely conformed to those on the two posthumous plasters, and further, the figure's structure and anatomy was perfect – not clumsy in any respect.

Shortly thereafter, Ms. Conn and I were introduced to the owner of the plaster, Leonardo Benatov. Mr. Benatov is the proprietor of one of the most famous foundries in the world, the Valsuani Foundry in Chevreuse, France. It was established by Claude Valsuani in 1908 at 74, rue des Plantes in Paris' 14th arrondissement,¹⁴ and over the years the Valsuani Foundry cast bronze master works by major nineteenth and twentieth century artists, ranging from Rodin and Renoir to Brancusi, Matisse and Picasso.

My research on the *Little Dancer* plaster began in 2001. Along with examining a number of the Hébrard *Little Dancer* bronzes and digging through archives, I had many consultations with others, including Mr. Benatov. During one of those meetings, in 2004, he abruptly rose from his chair and led Carol Conn and me to a locked room at the far end of the foundry. Inside were seventy-four other Degas plasters which were completely unknown to anyone outside the foundry or its close associates.

It was a shocking sight. To me it was the equivalent of opening King Tut's tomb in Egypt or uncovering the terra cotta warriors in China. The moment I gazed upon these remarkable plasters I instantly knew that everything that had been

written about Degas' sculptures in the past had to be reconsidered. I also realized these extraordinary objects would provide a tremendous body of information about Degas' sculptural history for other scholars and experts.

The group of seventy-four consisted of one of each of the following sculptures in plaster: Hébrard numbers 1 and 2, 4 through 72, and number 74. There were also two plaster versions of Hébrard number 3. Therefore, with the *Little Dancer* (Hébrard number 73), we located a total of seventy-five unknown Degas plasters at Valsuani. My research uncovered other vital information on a related subject while searching through the Valsuani archives for information about the plasters. It was in reference to the known number of bronzes made by Hébrard.

The Hébrard Foundry journals document they cast 567 Degas bronzes.¹⁵ Yet in 1995 *Apollo* magazine published a remarkable survey of the bronzes by Sara Campbell, Senior Curator of the Norton Simon Museum of Art in Pasadena, California, in which she reported: "I have located references to approximately 1,300 different casts of Degas bronze sculptures produced by the Hébrard foundry."¹⁶ The survey was updated in the 2002 *catalogue raisonné* of Degas' sculptures, in which 1,380 Hébrard bronzes are documented.¹⁷

Since it is known the Hébrard Foundry only cast 567 Degas bronzes and because 1,380 Degas bronzes with the Hébrard stamp are known to exist, the casting of at least 813 Hébrard bronzes could not be accounted for. That mystery was solved during the course of my research. The Valsuani archives revealed that Nelly Hébrard had resumed casting the Degas bronze editions at that foundry in 1955, six years after she purchased some rights from Degas' heirs.¹⁸

Why cast at Valsuani? Her family's foundry had closed eighteen years earlier. She had to cast elsewhere and chose Valsuani because of its outstanding reputation in utilizing the traditional *cire perdue* (lost wax) technique for casting bronzes. While this method of casting provides for the finest possible details on the finished bronzes, it is also the most time-consuming and difficult to master. Valsuani is known for perfecting the technique.

The 1955 resumption of casting at Valsuani concurs with Joseph Czestochowski's observations: "There are several references to the continued casting of the bronzes, especially after the early 1950's, by Albino Palazzolo, Hébrard's caster."¹⁹ The 1955 dating also corresponds to the provenance of the plasters. They were brought to the Valsuani Foundry by Albino Palazzolo in 1955.²⁰

Although Nelly Hébrard and Albino Palazzolo were casting at Valsuani from 1955 to 1964 they did not use that foundry's stamp on the bronzes. Instead they continued to use the old Hébrard stamp. So a great number of bronzes were cast at the Valsuani Foundry from 1955 to 1964 and all of them have the Hébrard stamp. It must also be noted that while the original contract with the Degas heirs and Hébrard strictly limited the casting of the bronzes to twenty-two of each, they cast many more of the popular images, including the *Little Dancers*.

In 2004, at just about the same time the seventy-four plasters came to light, Dr. Gregory Hedberg, Director of European Art for Hirschl & Adler Galleries in New York, purchased one of the *Little Dancer* bronzes from a French dealer. The bronze was cast from the previously unknown plaster.

Dr. Hedberg also recognized its great importance and began his own independent research. A mutual colleague informed him that I had been gathering information on the plaster. I shared my knowledge with him and we began to collaborate.

Since then Dr. Hedberg has conducted his own independent investigation, and with extensive further research has now concluded that Degas himself had the *Little Dancer* plaster made from his original wax at some point between 1887 and 1903.

We now know that after this plaster was made, Degas, as was his habit, continued to rework the *Little Dancer* wax. By the time he died in 1917 the artist had made several modifications, thus the details on his original wax had changed considerably.

As a result, when the two posthumous plasters were made from Degas' wax in 1921 by the Hébrard Foundry the details on those plasters were different than the details on the earlier plaster: the early one having been made from Degas' wax between 1887 and 1903, while the two later plasters were made in 1921 from Degas' wax after the artist had made his modifications.

As with the *Little Dancer* plaster, Dr. Hedberg concluded that all but two of the seventy-four plasters Carol Conn and I uncovered in 2004 can also be dated to Degas' lifetime, having been made between 1887 and 1912. The two exceptions are (a) one of the two plaster versions of Hébrard number 3, and (b), the plaster of Hébrard number 59. Also, as with the unknown *Little Dancer* plaster we found, it appears that no bronzes had ever been cast from any of these other plasters.

Recognizing the importance of this, The Degas Sculpture Project Ltd entered into special agreements with the legal heirs of Edgar Degas who authorized the casting of bronze sculptures from these remarkable plasters.

The bronzes were cast by the Valsuani Foundry in France under the supervision of Mr. Leonardo Benatov. Mr. Serge Goldenberg of Artco France was involved in the project's administration, and The Degas Sculpture Project Ltd is responsible for the organization and distribution of the bronzes to museums.

Valsuani utilized the traditional lost wax method of casting to ensure that each bronze is faithful in detail to the Degas plaster from which it was cast. Each bronze has a stamp of Degas' signature and the Valsuani Foundry along with the other appropriate stamps. All the bronzes were cast in strict accordance with French Law.

PART TWO: THE BRONZES

Valsuani versus Hébrard

One might ask, "What are the differences between the bronzes in this exhibition which were cast by the Valsuani Foundry from the rediscovered plasters and the Hébrard bronzes cast from the *Modèle* set?"

To understand the differences one must know something about the casting process. Since the 18th century, foundries around the world have used plasters as the masters from which to cast bronze editions. Foundries do not generally use bronze masters for three reasons: first; the metal shrinks by approximately two percent in the casting process, second; distortions sometimes occur, and third; a generation of details is lost. Plaster has no such shrinkage or distortion and the details on plasters remain faithful to the artist's intent.

When writing about the subject of using plasters as the masters from which to cast, Arthur Beale, who is an expert on the subject, correctly states: "Quite simply put, if one looks for a stable sculptural medium that brings us through time close to the hand of Degas, plaster meets the criterion."²¹

That is the reason foundries routinely make a mold from an original wax, and from that mold make a plaster. The plaster would be a perfect replica of the wax, and it would conform to the wax in terms of its size and details. Furthermore, since it would be hard and solid, the foundry could make a number of molds from the plaster without damage, and the bronze edition could then be cast from those molds.

But this is not what Hébrard did. With the exception of the two *Little Dancer* plasters made in 1921 to cast the bronze edition of that sculpture, for all the others the Hébrard Foundry made a master set of bronzes – not plasters. These bronze masters, known as the *Modèles*, were used to cast the Hébrard bronze editions of all the other seventy-three sculptures.

While it is true that a few artists, such as Antoine-Louis Barye (1795-1875) and Jean-Baptiste Carpeaux (1827-1875) did use bronze masters to cast editions,²² the ramifications of this unusual technique are significant. The bronze master *Modèles* made by Hébrard shrunk by approximately two percent in the casting process, making them two percent smaller than Degas' original waxes. In addition, the surface details on the *Modèles* were not as sharp as they were on the original waxes or what they would have been on plasters.

The edition bronzes then made from the *Modèles* also shrunk by two percent in the casting process. Thus they were four percent smaller than Degas' original waxes and another generation of surface details was also lost.

Such bronzes cast from other bronzes are referred to as surmoulages (casts from casts). Describing such a bronze, Arthur Beale observed: "It seems that it was what is called a "surmoulage" or "after cast," a second generation bronze not only smaller but exhibiting a diminution of surface detail as a result of the foundry process."²³

Surmoulages are typically not considered "original bronzes," and in fact they are normally not accepted by the art world. The Degas bronzes cast by Hébrard are among the few exceptions.

The bronzes in this exhibition, *The complete sculptures of Edgar Degas*, are not surmoulages. All of them, including the *Little Dancer*, were cast by Valsuani from original plasters made during Degas' lifetime with the artist's approval. Thus the Valsuani bronzes are superior in fidelity and closer to the hand of Degas.

The lifetime dating of the plasters is based on Dr. Hedberg's research. He concluded their history goes back to Paul-Albert Bartholomé, Degas' close friend and a sculptor himself. Degas allowed plasters to be made from his waxes by Bartholomé for his (Bartholomé's) personal collection. The various plasters were made over a period of years, from 1887 to 1912.

Bartholomé died in 1928. His wife, the model Florence Letessier, who was much younger, inherited his estate. Twenty-seven years later, in 1955, Mme. Letessier-Bartholomé was placed in an asylum. The contents of her home were dispersed, the plasters were taken to Palazzolo and he brought them to Valsuani where they remained for decades. Details regarding the provenance and the dating of the plasters are provided in Dr. Hedberg's essay which follows this one.

Given the plasters arrived at Valsuani in 1955, the same year Nelly Hébrard resumed the casting there, why were they not used as masters by Palazzolo to cast bronzes from that point forward? The answer is consistency.

Since all the earlier bronzes had been cast from the *Modèles*, Nelly Hébrard and Albino Palazzolo kept using them as masters and marked the bronzes with the old Hébrard stamp rather than Valsuani's, so that the new bronzes would appear identical to those which had been cast earlier at the Hébrard Foundry. This was apparently done to avoid any possible questions which might have been raised by

potential clients when Nelly Hébrard was selling the so-called "Hébrard" bronzes in the 1950s, 60s and 70s, those being the ones which had actually been cast at Valsuani.

At the time these plasters were revealed only five museums in the world had sets of bronzes.²⁴ Now that these remarkable plasters have finally come to light and bronzes have been cast from them, many other museums will have the privilege of owning and exhibiting the full collection of these extraordinary bronzes, and millions more will be able to view and appreciate these historic sculptures.

AUTHOR: WALTER F. MAIBAUM

Beginning his art world career in 1968 as a specialist in old master works on paper (Rembrandt, Goya, etc.), today Walter Maibaum is recognized as a leading authority on European art from Impressionism to the Modern era. Along with Degas, his expertise includes the works of Brancusi, Giacometti, Matisse and Picasso.

Mr. Maibaum is particularly known internationally as an expert on sculpture and casting techniques. As one of the world's foremost authorities on the subject he is routinely called upon to expertise sculpture, and frequently lectures on this and other topics. They include the authentication of art, determining values, national patrimony and issues concerning provenance. Mr. Maibaum is a certified expert witness for the United States government, has served as both a moderator and panelist on World Art Market conferences and has hosted more than fifty national television broadcasts on the arts in the United States.

Mr. Maibaum is the Curator for this and other international Degas sculpture exhibitions and is also the curator for two major collections of Russian Avant-Garde paintings, both headquartered in Switzerland. He chairs the Authentication Committee of The Salvador Dali Research Center, a member of the World Jurist Association and the National Association of Scholars. Walter Maibaum is the President of Modernism Fine Arts Inc based in New York and the Executive Director of The Degas Sculpture Project Ltd.

Mr. Maibaum's forthcoming two-volume book, *DEGAS: Sculptures Uncovered-History Revealed*, is scheduled to be published in early 2010. Volume One will update the casting history of Degas sculptures and include a catalog of the Degas plasters. Volume Two will catalog the Degas bronzes cast by the Valsuani Foundry.

www.DegasSculptureProject.com

© 2009 Walter F. Maibaum. All Rights Reserved.

1 Daphne Barbour, Object Conservator at the National Gallery of Art in Washington, D.C., and Shelly Sturman, who is head of Objects Conservation at the National Gallery, state: "*Etude de Chaval (Study of a Mustang)* (1859-60) is Degas' earliest extant sculpture." Daphne Barbour and Shelly Sturman, "Degas the Sculptor: Innovator and Non-Traditional," *Degas Sculptures*, Joseph S. Czestochowski and Anne Pingeot, International Arts and Torch Press, Memphis, 2002, p. 76.

2 Joris-Karl Huysmans, "L'Expositions des Indépendants en 1881," *L'art moderne*, Paris, 1883, p. 226-227.

3 Paul Mantz, "L'Exposition des Indépendants," *Le Courrier du Soir*, April 23, 1881, p. 3.

4 Elie de Mont, "L'Exposition des Indépendants," *La Civilisation*, April 21, 1881.

5 Joseph S. Czestochowski, "Degas's Sculptures Re-examined: The Marketing of a Private Pursuit," *Degas Sculptures*, Joseph S. Czestochowski and Anne Pingeot, International Arts and Torch Press, Memphis, 2002, p. 12.

- 6 Anne Pinget, "Inventaire de la Succession," *Degas Sculptures*, Anne Pinget and Frank Horvat, Imprimerie Nationale Éditions, Réunion des Musées Nationaux, 1991, pp 192-193.
- 7 Joseph S. Czestochowski, "Degas's Sculptures Re-examined: The Marketing of a Private Pursuit," *Degas Sculptures*, Joseph S. Czestochowski and Anne Pinget, International Arts and Torch Press, 2002, Memphis, p. 14.
- 8 Gary Tinterow, "The Havemeyer Pictures," *Splendid Legacy: The Havemeyer Collection* Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, 1993 p. 40.
- 9 John Rewald, "Degas' Bronzes – An Afterword," *The Complete Sculptures of Degas*, Lefevre Gallery, London 1976, p. 3.
- 10 John Rewald, "Forward," *Edgar Degas: Original Wax Sculptures*, M. Knoedler & Company, Inc., 1955, p. 3.
- 11 Arthur Beale, "Little Dancer Aged Fourteen: The Search for the Lost Modèle," *Degas and the Little Dancer*, Richard Kendall, Yale University Press in association with the Joslyn Art Museum, Omaha, Nebraska, 1998, p. 99.
- 12 Arthur Beale, "Little Dancer, Aged Fourteen: The Search for the Lost Modèle," *Degas and the Little Dancer*, Richard Kendall, Yale University Press in association with the Joslyn Art Museum, Omaha, Nebraska, 1998, p. 98.
- 13 Among other publications, Lawrence Saphire authored *Fernand Leger: The Complete Graphic Work*, Blue Moon Press, New York, 1978, and *André Masson: The Complete Graphic Work, Volume One: Surrealism, 1924-49*, Blue Moon Press, New York, 1990.
- 14 Dictionnaire des Foundeurs de Bronze d'Art: France 1890-1950, Elisabeth Lebon, Marjon Éditions, Perth, Australia, 2003, p. 259.
- 15 Joseph S. Czestochowski and Anne Pinget, "Introduction to the Collection," *Degas Sculptures*, Joseph S. Czestochowski and Anne Pinget, International Arts and Torch Press, Memphis, 2002, p. 118.
- 16 Sara Campbell, "A Catalog of Degas' Bronzes," *Apollo* magazine, August 1995, London p. 6.
- 17 Joseph Czestochowski and Anne Pinget, "Introduction to the Collection," *Degas Sculptures*, Joseph S. Czestochowski and Anne Pinget, 2002, International Arts and Torch Press, Memphis, p. 118-119.
- 18 Documentation establishing this provenance will be provided in my forthcoming two volume book: *DEGAS: Sculptures Uncovered – History revealed*.
- 19 Joseph S. Czestochowski and Anne Pinget, "Introduction to the Collection," *Degas Sculptures*, Joseph S. Czestochowski and Anne Pinget, 2002, International Arts and Torch Press, Memphis p. 118-119.
- 20 Mr. Benatov provided seventy-five Attestations, each dated 21 Mars 2006 (March 21, 2006), and each testifying to the provenance of the plasters: they were brought to the Valsuani Foundry by Albino Palazzolo in 1955. There is one Attestation for each plaster, including one for each of the two plaster versions of Hébrard number 3.
- 21 Arthur Beale, "Little Dancer Aged Fourteen: The Search for the Lost Modèle," *Degas and the Little Dancer*, Richard Kendall, Yale University Press in association with the Joslyn Art Museum, Omaha, 1998, p. 101.
- 22 Arthur Beale, "Little Dancer, Aged Fourteen: The Search for the Lost Modèle," *Degas and the Little Dancer*, Richard Kendall, Yale University Press in association with the Joslyn Art Museum, Omaha, Nebraska, 1998, p. 98.
- 23 Arthur Beale, "Little Dancer Aged Fourteen: The Search for the Lost Modèle," *Degas and the Little Dancer*, Richard Kendall, Yale University Press in association with the Joslyn Museum of Art, Omaha, 1998, p. 99.

24 The museum sets are in the collections of the Norton Simon Museum of Art, Pasadena, California USA (the *Modèle* set), the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, USA (set A), The Musée d'Orsay, Paris, France (set P), The Ny Carlsberg Glyptotek Museum, Copenhagen, Denmark (set R), and the Museu de Arte de São Paulo Assis Chateaubriand, São Paulo, Brazil (set S).